Critical Evaluation of Information Resources

There are many types of resources that you may encounter when conducting research: books, articles, Web sites, etc. How do you assess the usefulness of resources for your own research needs?

See also:

• Critical Evaluation of Web Resources

1. Is the Resource Suitable for My Research?

- Does it provide a basic overview of my topic? Does it place my topic within the context of a larger subject area?
- Does it cover a time period that I am interested in?
- Is the article too basic or elementary for my needs? Is it too specialized or technical for my needs? Who is this resource geared towards?
- When was this resource published? Do I need the most current information or analysis on this topic, or is older information appropriate for my needs?

2. Is the Information Authoritative?

- Who wrote and/or published this resource? What credentials qualify him to write on this topic?
 What else has he written?
- Do I require scholarly information, or is more popular material also appropriate?

	Scholarly	Popular
Purpose/Content	Disseminate new research and	Inform and entertain the public.
	theory. Extensive detail of theory, methods and research tools.	News, opinion pieces, general interest stories.
Audience	Academics, postsecondary	General public. Subject expertise
	students. Assumes subject	not generally expected.
	expertise.	
Authors	Scholars (PhDs, faculty, curators,	Reporters, journalists.
A 1 1111	etc.).	
Accountability	Peer-reviewed.	Editor, fact checkers, journalistic ethics.
Appearance	Plain, articles with abstracts & bibliographies, only graphics	Eye-catching, many pictures, often substantial advertising.
	necessary to elucidate a point,	3
	little advertising.	
Publisher	Scholarly society, university, or	Commercial.
	specialist commercial firm.	
Access	University libraries. Generally	Newsstands, individual
	indexed in index specific to its	subscribers, public libraries.
	field (e.g., Philosophers Index).	Reputable publications indexed by
		general purpose indexes (e.g.,

3. Documentation

• What sources does the author cite to back up her points? Is a bibliography included with the

Critical Evaluation of Information Resources

Published on E.J. Pratt Library (https://library.vicu.utoronto.ca)

information?

• If the information relies heavily on statistics, where did those statistics come from? Were they gathered in a methodologically appropriate manner? Were they pulled from another reputable source (e.g., Statistics Canada)?

4. Objectivity

• Is the information fact, opinion, or propaganda? Is the author trying to advance a particular position? Is there a clearly supported argument or is the argument inflammatory and unsupported? Is the publication or organization providing the information known for having a particular philosophical or political position?

5. Primary vs. Secondary Sources

Primary Secondary

Original Research. Evaluation or overview of previously presented

material.

A journal article that presents new findings and new A scientific review article.

theories.

A newspaper account written by a journalist who An encyclopedia entry.

was present at the event he or she is describing.

Dissertations. A textbook.

Last updated: August 5, 2014

Source URL:

https://library.vicu.utoronto.ca/research resources/how do i/critical evaluation information resources